



Mr Chris Jones  
Chief Officer, Schools and Lifelong Learning  
Cardiff County Council  
County Hall  
Atlantic Wharf  
Cardiff  
CF10 4UW

Eich cyf . Your ref  
Ein cyf . Our ref                   A-EDF 681-20-qA687086

26 May 2010

Dear Mr Jones

**SCHOOL STANDARDS AND FRAMEWORK ACT 1998 - SECTIONS 28 AND 29  
PROPOSALS TO REORGANISE PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN CANTON AND  
GRANGETOWN, CARDIFF TO:**

- **DISCONTINUE LANSDOWNE PRIMARY SCHOOL**
- **DISCONTINUE YSGOL TAN YR EOS**
- **TRANSFER YSGOL TREGANNA TO THE PREMISES OF LANSDOWNE PRIMARY SCHOOL, INCREASE ITS CAPACITY TO 420 PLACES AND EXTEND THE AGE RANGE FROM 4-11 TO 3-11**
- **MAKE PRESCRIBED ALTERATION TO RADNOR PRIMARY SCHOOL BY EXPANDING INTO THE VACATED PREMISES OF YSGOL TREGANNA, INCREASING ITS CAPACITY TO 420 PLACES AND EXTENDING THE AGE RANGE FROM 4-11 TO 3-11.**

I refer to the above mentioned proposals published on 20 May 2009 by the Council of the City and County of Cardiff ("the local authority") under Sections 28 and 29 of the School Standards and Framework Act 1998 ("the 1998 Act"). Under paragraph 8(1)(b) of Schedule 6 to the 1998 Act, the proposal requires approval by the Welsh Ministers.

This matter has been considered by Carwyn Jones, one of the Welsh Ministers

I am directed by the First Minister to say that he has carefully considered each of the proposals, the statutory objections submitted to him, the local authority's comments thereon and the supporting evidence supplied by the local authority in accordance with the Education (School Organisation Proposals) (Wales) Regulations 1999 ("the 1999 Regulations"). In exercise of his powers under paragraph 8(2) of Schedule 6 to the 1998 Act and with due regard to Circulars 9/99 and 23/02<sup>1</sup>, **the First Minister has decided to reject the proposals.**

<sup>1</sup> Both Circulars were issued by the National Assembly for Wales as constituted by the Government of Wales Act 1998. Further to the Government of Wales Act 2006, those Circulars should now be regarded as if made by the Welsh Ministers

In summary, in reaching this decision, having considered the relevant guidance in circular 23/02, and taking into account all matters brought to his attention, the First Minister was not satisfied, in particular, that these proposals would ensure the delivery of a broad and balanced curriculum, including all the required elements of the curriculum, for all affected age groups. Although a number of benefits would result from the proposals, the concern about future delivery of a broad and balanced curriculum outweighs these benefits. The First Minister also considered that, while the standard of provision would improve for the Welsh medium sector, it would not improve for the English medium sector, especially in the short term (up to 6 years) particularly compared with current provision in terms of resources and space. For each of those reasons, whether considered separately or cumulatively, the First Minister is satisfied that the proposals would not accord with the circular, that there is no adequate justification for departing from the circular and is satisfied that the proposals should not be approved.

The First Minister is satisfied that the local authority has met the statutory requirements in respect of the publication of the proposals, and notes that it has submitted, in accordance with the 1999 Regulations, the information required in Schedule 4 to those Regulations.

### **Objections to the proposals**

The First Minister notes that there was a combined total of 1759 statutory objections to the closure of Lansdowne Primary School and Ysgol Tan yr Eos including objections from pupils of Lansdowne Primary School, parents, relatives, residents and other interested parties and one each from the following:

- Lansdowne Primary School Staff and Governors
- Lansdowne Primary School Action Committee
- Canton Labour Party
- Bangladeshi Community Leaders
- Rhodri Morgan Cardiff West AM
- Kevin Brennan Cardiff West MP
- Canton Councillors
- Islamic Education Centre (Jalalia Mosque)

He has noted the principal concerns of the objectors. These are summarised in the Statement of Information on which he based his decision. He also noted the summary of the local authority responses, and these are also included in the Statement of Information. The Statement of Information can be accessed through the Welsh Assembly Government website via the following link.

<http://new.wales.gov.uk/publications/accessinfo/drnewhomepage/?lang=en>

The First Minister also notes that almost 400 letters in support of the proposals were submitted to the local authority. The First Minister acknowledges that this was an unusual situation and recognises that the support expressed reflects the strong desire by parents to see Welsh medium provision expand, an aim which the First Minister fully supports.

### **The First Minister's conclusions**

In brief, the proposals would, if implemented, lead to the closure of Lansdowne Primary School. At present two primary schools, Ysgol Treganna and Radnor, effectively share a site. Ysgol Treganna would transfer to the site of the existing Lansdowne School (and

prescribed alterations would be made to enable that to occur). Pupils who would otherwise be expected to attend the Lansdowne School would be able to transfer to Radnor Primary School and the necessary prescribed alterations would be made to expand its capacity and extend the age range at that school.

After careful consideration, the First Minister considers that whilst the responses made by the local authority adequately answer most of the issues raised in the statutory objections, there are matters where he is not satisfied that the proposals accord with the circular. His specific conclusions on the principal relevant matters are set out below. The First Minister also considered that, while the standard of provision would improve for the Welsh medium sector, it would not improve for the English medium sector, especially in the short term (up to 6 years). The First Minister has received advice from Estyn on the following educational aspects of these proposals.

**(i) Standards of education provision in the area**

On the basis of the evidence of the most recent Estyn inspections reports, benchmarked performance data and advice from Estyn, the First Minister was content that in terms of access to suitably qualified teachers, children transferring from Lansdowne to Radnor Primary would receive education of a good standard. This includes provision which is made for children with Special Educational Needs. On the basis of Estyn inspections, the quality of provision at the two schools currently appears very similar. A single larger school for 420 would have a larger budget, with consequently greater flexibility in its expenditure, and the larger body of staff associated with a school of that size would offer more scope for subject specialism, increased sharing of good practice, and ease in delivering the curriculum.

The First Minister was not convinced that in terms of provision of school buildings and facilities, this proposal would lead to improved provision for future pupils at Radnor Road for up to 6 years following the implementation of the proposals. The First Minister noted that whilst the total capacity of the buildings at Radnor Road is large enough to provide for 420 pupils in the longer term, the current buildings would need adaptation to accommodate a larger number than that (potentially, according to information provided by the local authority, up to 575), as in the short term a large number of the existing pupils at Lansdowne would be transferred to Radnor. This would involve a restriction on resource space in order to provide for the larger number of pupils to be accommodated on site in the shorter term (which, based on information from the local authority could be for up to 6 years).

The First Minister is aware that the local authority intends to invest in the buildings and the playground to ensure that access to suitable provision is in place for the longer term; that there will be improvements in terms of access for disabled pupils; and there are plans to improve the external play space with more suitable surfaces. The First Minister was concerned to note that when compared with Building Bulletin guidance, the site at Radnor overall is around 17% smaller than would be recommended for a school of 420 primary aged pupils with a nursery. The outdoor space available is also considerably less than would be expected for a new or refurbished school for this number of pupils. Therefore in terms of access to suitable outdoor and play space, the First Minister believes that the pupils at the expanded Radnor school would be under provided for in that respect, as are the pupils currently attending the 2 schools based on the site. This is an issue that has been highlighted in an Estyn inspection on Ysgol Treganna.

The First Minister recognises that the Building Bulletin guidance is not statutory but he is concerned that the proposed arrangements for Radnor could limit the range of experiences the school would be able to provide and the opportunities for pupils to learn in a wide variety of ways. These could include having insufficient space and resources to make the most of the learning activities provided. In particular, those transferring from Lansdowne would not in the near future, if the proposal were approved, have access to the range of extra resource and play space from which they benefit in their current school. Whilst in terms of teaching input, the First Minister acknowledges that the proposals might improve the standard of provision in the area, he doubted that it would improve provision in terms of the school estate for the English medium sector, for up to 6 years and potentially for longer.

The First Minister perceived that for pupils in the Welsh medium sector, provision would be improved. A more viable school would result from closing of Tan yr Eos and the transfer of pupils to a transferred and enlarged Treganna, which would also have nursery provision. A larger body of staff would ensue with associated benefits in terms of the delivery of the curriculum. There would be ample space at the new site to enable pupils to have access to an IT suite and other benefits not currently available to them.

Overall the First Minister concluded that the standard of education provision would improve for the Welsh medium sector, but was not convinced that this would be the case for the English medium sector especially in the short term (up to 6 years) but also in the longer term, particularly compared with current provision in terms of resources and space.

#### **(ii) Delivery of a broad and balanced curriculum**

There are additional aspects of the proposal which relate to the site and buildings at Radnor Primary that have caused the First Minister to question whether, overall, this proposal will be in the educational interests of the majority of the children involved. The local authority has stated that the proposal has been developed with reference to the Building Bulletin guidance which makes recommendations about site size. Having sought professional advice about site sizes, it appears clear to the First Minister, that the site available at Radnor is smaller than the minimum recommended in the Building Bulletin for 420 pupils and a 26 (Full time equivalent) place nursery. Furthermore, the local authority has explained to the First Minister, that in order to implement the proposal, in the short term (approximately 6 years) there would potentially be some 575 pupils on roll at Radnor Primary, apart from the nursery pupils.

The First Minister was concerned that such a large number of pupils would be on a site that is rather smaller than recommended for a school of 420 pupils. Whilst the buildings might accommodate this number of pupils because rooms could be used more flexibly and duplication of use reduced, the First Minister has noted that the hall available would appear to be smaller than recommended for a school of 420, let alone 575, and that the outdoor space would be considerably less than the recommended minimum for 420 pupils. The First Minister takes the view that it is important that pupils have space for play and that the outside space also needs to be suitable for enriching the curriculum, particularly for pupils in the Foundation Phase, a difficulty that was highlighted by some objectors. The First Minister is concerned that the restrictions on space would not lend themselves to the delivery of a broad and balanced curriculum, particularly for the youngest pupils.

The First Minister is aware that the local authority has suggested that in order to avoid perceived overcrowding on the Radnor site arising from the presence of up to 600 pupils, the transfer of pupils from Lansdowne could be staged and that part of the Lansdowne site

could be retained for the use of English medium pupils until such time that the number on roll at Radnor reduces to 420. The First Minister recognises that many schools operate split site arrangements and that these can work well. He does not view such arrangements as ideal, and believes that it is preferable that they are not created in order to implement a proposal unless it is for a very limited period. The local authority's suggestion could, the First Minister believes, lead to the creation of either a split site school for up to 6 years, or a school site that accommodates substantially more pupils than it should for that length of time. The First Minister is not satisfied that either scenario would ensure the delivery of a broad and balanced curriculum for these children; a consideration of prime importance as factor to be taken into account in deciding a proposal (Circular 23/02).

Whilst there may be schools with over 400 pupils with sites of a comparable size currently functioning satisfactorily elsewhere in Wales, and indeed in Cardiff, the First Minister believes that if a school is identified as part of a reorganisation proposal, the result should be a school that provides the best possible opportunities for pupils. The site at Radnor might be more suitable, based on the Building Bulletin guidance, for a school of 1.5 form entry than for a school of 2 forms of entry, and the First Minister considered whether it might be appropriate to modify the proposal to that effect following consultation with the local authority. However, he was not persuaded to proceed in this direction as this would have reduced provision of English medium places below a level which the local authority anticipates is necessary for the future.

In summary, therefore, on this issue, the First Minister is not satisfied that the proposals would ensure the delivery of a broad and balanced curriculum, including all the required elements of the curriculum for all affected age groups, including those who would be attending school at the Radnor site in the short and long term.

### **(iii) The standard of education currently provided and the continuing ability of schools to maintain satisfactory standards**

In respect of the standard of pupil achievement, the First Minister was concerned, that if the proposal were implemented a reduction in resource space at Radnor in the short term might present teachers with challenges in ensuring that standards remained satisfactory.

The First Minister noted that the last inspection report on Treganna was very good and that standards achieved by pupils are good. It is difficult for the First Minister to conclude whether standards would or would not decline at Treganna without the proposals, but believes that if the local authority continues to breach the admission number generated by the capacity formula, standards might become less satisfactory. If Treganna were to transfer to larger better equipped buildings, this could support improved attainment by pupils. However the First Minister was unable to draw a firm conclusion that standards achieved by all pupils who would move as a result of the proposals would either improve or decline as a result of the proposals. There has been no report on the standard of education at Tan yr Eos and the First Minister has been unable to draw a conclusion on the ability of the school to maintain satisfactory standards either with or without the proposals, although he notes that the accommodation available to the school may be sufficient only for the very near future.

However, in the absence of advice from Estyn that there is a clear link between the standards achieved by pupils and space made available, the First Minister could find no strong evidence either way that the schools would be unable to maintain satisfactory

standards in terms of pupil achievement, with or without the proposals. In those circumstances, the First Minister would not regard this issue as a reason for not approving the proposals.

### **Finance**

The First Minister took the view that the proposals represent a cost effective use of public funds by seeking to utilise surplus English medium provision to meet the need for Welsh medium provision. He noted that revenue savings that would result from the closure of schools would assist in meeting the capital costs of improving school buildings and welcomed that approach.

### **Other issues raised by objectors**

Cultural diversity/effect on pupils whose first language is not English - on the basis of the Estyn Inspection Report for Radnor Primary School and the fact that the school already has a high number of children from ethnic minority backgrounds, the First Minister sees no reason to believe that children from such backgrounds, including those whose first language is not English, would be disadvantaged if they were to transfer from Lansdowne Primary School to Radnor Primary School. Both schools currently have an ethnically mixed intake and the First Minister has seen no evidence to demonstrate that Lansdowne can better accommodate the needs of children from ethnic minority backgrounds.

Some objectors were concerned that the implementation of these proposals would result in an imbalance in the ethnic make up of Canton's English medium schools. Given that both Lansdowne and Radnor Primary Schools' current pupil populations contain a significant minority drawn from ethnic minority backgrounds, if, as the local authority expected, most Lansdowne Primary School children transfer to Radnor Primary School, it is not clear to the First Minister that the position would be very much changed, if this proposal were implemented, from that which currently exists.

Serving the Community - as no school site would be lost as a consequence of the implementation of these proposals, the First Minister was satisfied by the local authority's argument that the out of school provision available to both pupils and the wider community will be largely unaffected by these proposals.

Pupil forecasts/surplus places/nursery places - the First Minister notes that objectors have correctly identified that the birth rate in the Canton area, along with many other areas of Cardiff, has increased in recent years and that this is having an impact on the numbers being admitted to nursery and primary education. However, the First Minister has seen no evidence to suggest that the local authority's methodology for projecting future pupil numbers is inappropriate or that its projections are likely to be inaccurate. He has reviewed the local authority's most recent (2009) pupil projections and compared them with the numbers on roll at January 2010, and is satisfied that between them, the remaining English medium schools in Canton, providing 420 places each, would have sufficient capacity to meet the demand for places generated from within Canton itself. The First Minister notes that this would probably mean fewer pupils from outside of Canton would have been able to gain a place at schools in the Canton area than is currently the case, but notes that this was a declared objective of the local authority in bringing forward the proposal and is in line with the principle of 'local schools for local children'.

### School sites/Alternative Solutions/Consultation

In opposing the proposal some objectors have taken the view that there would be significant disruption for a number of pupils and teachers, and that a relatively large number of local pupils attend Lansdowne.

The First Minister noted that only 31% of pupils in the catchment area for Lansdowne attend their local English medium school, and that only 22% of Radnor catchment pupils attend theirs. The First Minister has observed that almost twice as many pupils live in the Lansdowne catchment area as live in the Radnor catchment area, and that there is a strong argument to support the location of the English medium primary to serve this area in the current catchment area where there are a greater number of pupils choosing local English medium provision. The First Minister noted that Ysgol Pwll Coch is already conveniently located for children from the Lansdowne catchment area and this is the school that most parents from that catchment area prefer if they choose Welsh medium education. Whilst the local authority proposal does not seem to the First Minister to be the most strategic proposal that the local authority could have developed, he recognises that the schools subject to the proposal are in close proximity and either would be sufficiently conveniently located to serve the combined catchment area in the future, and that pupils would not have to travel unreasonable distances to school.

Many objectors have suggested that the local authority's original (2006) proposal to close Radnor Primary School rather than Lansdowne Primary School, and allow Ysgol Treganna to expand into the vacant site, would be a better way of addressing the issue of surplus places in the English medium sector and oversubscription in the Welsh medium. Concerns have also been expressed that the option of closing Radnor Primary School was not one specifically consulted upon by the local authority.

However, the First Minister notes that the local authority, in response to the objectors presented a rationale for their choice of Lansdowne as an option for closure and consequently consulted upon that as an option rather than the one preferred by some objectors. The First Minister recognises that the local authority is entitled to only consult on the proposals that it wishes to bring forward and that the role of the Welsh Ministers is to determine whether to approve, approve with modifications, reject or give a conditional approval to the proposals, not necessarily to consider whether a different proposal might be superior. However, whilst it is entirely for the local authority to decide which proposals it wishes to consult upon, case law has established that the points and issues raised in the consultation must be conscientiously considered in reaching a final decision and in deciding which statutory proposals to publish. The arguments for closing Radnor and expanding Treganna on that site were clearly put forward by respondents to the consultation. Therefore the local authority needed to consider those arguments (as a product of the consultation) conscientiously before reaching final decisions on the proposals. The local authority were certainly aware of the arguments being put and included the figures of those consultees who preferred to close Radnor rather than Lansdowne in its report to the Executive prior to the publication of proposals. However, it is unclear from the information provided to the Welsh Ministers by the local authority whether it has conscientiously taken into account the option of shutting Radnor school (as a product of the consultation) before finalising the proposals or whether, as the local authority had ruled that option out earlier it did in fact not consider the arguments made on this issue during the consultation exercise. If the First Minister had otherwise been minded to approve the proposals, he would have wished to raise this matter with the local authority and sought reassurance that the local authority had considered the arguments put in favour of closing Radnor during the consultation exercise when it came to consider its decision. However, as the First Minister considers that the proposals should not be

approved for other reasons, it was not necessary to reach a concluded view on this aspect of the objections to the proposal.

A large number of objectors have opposed the closure of Ysgol Tan yr Eos, some suggesting that this school should be expanded on its current site or re-established elsewhere so that it could accommodate the increasing number of children from Grangetown attending the Welsh medium schools in Canton. The First Minister noted that the school was established as a 'starter class' to serve the Canton and Grangetown areas and was to be temporarily located in surplus accommodation at Ninian Park Primary school whilst a permanent site was sought. He also notes that few of the children currently attending Ysgol Tan yr Eos are from the Grangetown area and that Ysgol Tan yr Eos currently operates as though it were part of Ysgol Treganna. In addition, he notes that all the available accommodation at the Ninian Park site will be fully occupied by September 2010 leaving the local authority with little time to relocate the school elsewhere. In the light of these facts, the First Minister believes it was reasonable for the local authority to want to bring Ysgol Tan yr Eos and Ysgol Treganna together as one school on one site. The First Minister notes that the current level of applications for places at Welsh medium schools from parents living in Grangetown suggests that demand is sufficient for the local authority to consider establishing a school there.

So far as consultation is concerned, the First Minister was concerned that the closure of Ysgol Tan yr Eos, and the arguments for that course, were not specifically addressed in the consultation exercise and considers that they should have been. Ultimately, however, he is satisfied that the consultation exercise, including the meetings with staff, governors and parents, did ensure that those who might wish to object to the closure of Tan yr Eos did know of that option and the rationale and had an adequate opportunity to make representations upon it. Whilst the consultation exercise could have been better conducted in relation to Tan yr Eos, he is satisfied that there was adequate consultation and would have not rejected the proposal on that ground.

Save for the matters outlined above, the First Minister is satisfied that both the duration (7 weeks) and manner of the consultation conducted by the local authority in relation to these proposals was adequate and that those with interest in the proposals had the opportunity to express their views, including those whose first language is not English or Welsh.

#### Transition

The First Minister recognised that much of the finer detail of transition would have to be worked out in conjunction with the staff and governing bodies of the schools involved in the event of approval of the proposal. However a brief outline of what was expected to happen could have been provided by the local authority. Despite this, he is satisfied that this lack of information was not a serious flaw in the validity of the consultation process. The local authority has subsequently informed the First Minister that their intention was that all children would transfer to their new locations ready to start the new academic year (2011-12).

The First Minister has considered all other points raised in the objections. This letter sets out the conclusions reached on what appears to the First Minister to be the principal issues that arise. The fact that any matter is not specifically mentioned does not mean that it has not been considered.

## Conclusion

In rejecting this proposal, the First Minister recognises that the current Treganna/Radnor site operates with more than 420 pupils.

Parents representing pupils in the Welsh medium schools, supporting the proposals, have drawn attention to the severe constraints of the site and the First Minister has every sympathy with their viewpoint and their strong desire for better accommodation for their children. However he is conscious that for pupils who would transfer to Radnor Primary School from Lansdowne Primary School, their educational experience would be potentially impaired by the constraints of a smaller site – a point which was raised by objectors.

Although the First Minister has received suggestions from the local authority about how this impact might in practice be lessened, he is not convinced that these suggestions are an adequate substitute for the minimum site areas recommended by Building Bulletin 99. The First Minister believes that in particular, the delivery of the foundation phase, which will increasingly rely on pupils having regular access to suitable outside space could be compromised on this site.

In summary the First Minister rejects these proposals for each of the following reasons:

- they are not likely to improve the standard of education provision in the area. In particular, they could detract from educational provision for a significant number of pupils by providing a school (the proposed new Radnor school) that will not be on a sufficiently sized site in the short or longer term
- they do not ensure the delivery of a broad and balanced curriculum because of the physical constraints, for a large number of pupils for up to 6 years, and potentially for the foreseeable future

The First Minister recognises that there are strong arguments for the reorganisation of primary schools in the Canton area of Cardiff. He hopes that the local authority will now consider afresh how it can ensure a better match between the demand and supply of school places in the English and Welsh medium primary sectors in the Canton area and at the same time ensure that all pupils have access to local schools with appropriate buildings and facilities, irrespective of the language medium.

The First Minister is keenly aware of the strength of feeling of parents of Welsh medium pupils who desire a solution offering a sustainable school for the future in their own neighbourhood. He feels sure however, that those parents would not want to see the education of a much larger group of pupils potentially compromised as a result of their needs being met. Although the First Minister is aware that the local authority will open 3 new schools offering Welsh medium provision in Cardiff in the course of the next academic year, progress in addressing need in this area of Cardiff has been slow. The First Minister accepts that the proposal has been with the Welsh Assembly Government for longer than he would have wished. However, the complexity of these proposals and the large number of objections received has meant that the consideration of these proposals has taken longer than would normally be the case for school organisation proposals. He notes also that the local authority consulted twice on this statutory proposal before publishing a notice and that these 2 exercises were conducted 12 months apart. The First Minister recognises that the local authority has a difficult task with which to deal, but he urges them to re-address it as soon as possible.

The First Minister looks to the local authority to tackle the current deficiencies in provision for Welsh medium primary education in the Canton area **as a matter of extreme urgency** and bring forward proposals that secure the interests of all pupils for the future.

I am sending a copy of this letter to Tom Morgan, the Chief Executive of Cardiff Council, the Headteachers and Chair of Governors at Lansdowne Primary School, Radnor Primary School, Ysgol Treganna, Ysgol Tan yr Eos, Severn Primary School, Kitchener Primary School, and Ninian Park Primary School and the statutory objectors. The Chief Executive, Headteachers and Chairs of Governors will receive a copy of the Statement of Information.

Yours sincerely

*Sylvia Lindoe*

**SYLVIA LINDOE  
HEAD OF SCHOOLS MANAGEMENT AND EFFECTIVENESS DIVISION**



Mr Chris Jones  
Prif Swyddog, Ysgolion a Dysgu Gydol Oes  
Cyngor Dinas Caerdydd  
Neuadd y Sir  
Glanfa'r Iwerydd  
Caerdydd  
CF10 4UW

Eich cyf . Your ref  
Ein cyf . Our ref                    A-EDF 681-20-qA687086

26 Mai 2010

Annwyl Mr Jones

**DEDDF SAFONAU A FFRAMWAITH YSGOLION 1998 - ADRANNAU 28 A 29  
CYNIGION I AD-DREFNU YSGOLION CYNRADD YN NHREGANNA AC YN  
GRANGETOWN, CAERDYDD:**

- **CAU YSGOL GYNRADD LANSDOWNE**
- **CAU YSGOL TAN YR EOS**
- **TROSGLWYDDO YSGOL TREGANNA I SAFLE YSGOL GYNRADD LANSDOWNE  
A CHYNYDDU CAPASITI'R YSGOL I 420 O LEOEDD AC EHANGU'R YSTOD  
OEDRAN O 4-11 I 3-11**
- **GWNEUD NEWID RHAGNODEDIG I YSGOL GYNRADD RADNOR DRWY  
YMESTYN YSGOL GYNRADD RADNOR I SAFLE GWAG YSGOL TREGANNA A  
CHYNYDDU CAPASITI'R YSGOL I 420 O LEOEDD AC EHANGU'R YSTOD  
OEDRAN O 4-11 I 3-11.**

Cyfeiriad at y cynigion uchod a gyhoeddwyd ar 20 Mai 2009 gan Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd ("yr awdurdod lleol") o dan Adranau 28 a 29 o Ddeddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998 ("Deddf 1998"). O dan baragraff 8(1)(b) o Atodlen 6 i Ddeddf 1998, mae'n ofynnol i Weinidogion Cymru gymeradwyo'r cynnig.

Mae'r mater hwn wedi'i ystyried gan Carwyn Jones, un o Weinidogion Cymru.

Yr wyf wedi cael fy nghyfarwyddo gan Brif Weinidog Cymru i ddweud ei fod wedi mynd ati'n ofalus, yn unol â Rheoliadau Addysg (Cynigion Trefniadaeth Ysgolion) (Cymru) 1999 ("Rheoliadau 1999"), i ystyried pob un o'r cynigion, y gwrthwynebiadau statudol a gyflwynwyd iddo, sylwadau'r awdurdod lleol am y gwrthwynebiadau hynny a'r dystiolaeth ategol a ddarparwyd gan yr awdurdod lleol. Wrth arfer ei bwerau o dan baragraff 8(2) o Atodlen 6 i Ddeddf 1998, a chan roi'r sylw dyledus i Gylchlythyrau 9/99 a 23/02<sup>1</sup>, mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi penderfynu gwrthod y cynigion.

<sup>1</sup> Cafodd y naill Gylchlythyr a'r llall eu cyhoeddi gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru fel y'i cyfansoddwyd o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Yn dilyn Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, dylid ystyried y Cylchlythyrau hynny bellach fel pe baent wedi'u gwneud gan Weinidogion Cymru.



I grynhoi, wrth wneud ei benderfyniad, ar ôl ystyried y canllawiau perthnasol yng nghylchlythyr 23/02, ac ar ôl rhoi ystyriaeth i'r holl faterion a gafodd eu dwyn at ei sylw, nid oedd y Prif Weinidog yn fodlon, yn benodol, y byddai'r cynigion hyn yn fodd i sicrhau y byddai cwricwlwm eang a chytbwys, gan gynnwys holl elfennau gofynnol y cwricwlwm, yn cael ei ddarparu ar gyfer yr holl grwpiau oedran yr effeithir arnynt. Er y byddai'r cynigion yn esgor ar nifer o fanteision, mae'r pryder ynghylch a fyddai modd darparu cwricwlwm eang a chytbwys yn y dyfodol yn drech na'r manteision hyn. Roedd y Prif Weinidog hefyd o'r farn, er y byddai safon y ddarpariaeth yn gwella ar gyfer y sector cyfrwng Cymraeg, na fyddai'n gwella ar gyfer y sector cyfrwng Saesneg, yn enwedig yn y tymor byr (am gyfnod o hyd at 6 blynedd), yn benodol felly o'i chymharu â'r ddarpariaeth bresennol o ran yr adnoddau a'r lle sydd ar gael. Am bob un o'r rhesymau hynny, o'u hystyried ar wahân neu gyda'i gilydd, mae'r Prif Weinidog yn fodlon na fyddai'r cynigion yn unol â'r canllawiau yn y cylchlythyr, nad oes digon o gyfiawnhad dros beidio â gweithredu yn unol â'r cylchlythyr, ac na ddylid cymeradwyo'r cynigion.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn fodlon bod yr awdurdod lleol wedi bodloni'r gofynion statudol o ran cyhoeddi'r cynigion, ac mae'n nodi ei fod, yn unol â Rheoliadau 1999, wedi cyflwyno'r wybodaeth sy'n ofynnol yn unol ag Atodlen 4 i'r Rheoliadau hynny.

### **Gwrthwynebiadau i'r cynigion**

Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn nodi bod cyfanswm o 1759 o wrthwynebiadau statudol i'r cynnig i gau Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne ac Ysgol Tan yr Eos, gan gynnwys gwrthwynebiadau oddi wrth ddisgyblion Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne, rhieni, perthnasau, trigolion a phartion eraill â buddiant, ac un yr un oddi wrth y canlynol:

Staff a Llywodraethwyr Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne  
Pwyllgor Gweithredu Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne  
Plaid Lafur Treganna  
Arweinwyr y Gymuned Bangladeshaid  
Rhodri Morgan AC Gorllewin Caerdydd  
Kevin Brennan AS Gorllewin Caerdydd  
Cynghorwyr Treganna  
Y Ganolfan Addysg Islamaidd (Mosg Jalalia)

Mae wedi nodi prif bryderon y gwrthwynebwyr. Ceir crynodeb o'r gwrthwynebiadau hynny yn y Datganiad Gwybodaeth sy'n sail i'w benderfyniad. Nododd hefyd y crynodeb o ymatebion yr awdurdod lleol, ac fe'u cynhwysir hwy hefyd yn y Datganiad Gwybodaeth. Mae'r Datganiad Gwybodaeth i'w weld ar wefan Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru drwy'r ddolen a ganlyn:

<http://new.wales.gov.uk/publications/accessinfo/drnewhomepage/?lang=en>

Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn nodi hefyd fod yr awdurdod lleol wedi cael bron 400 o lythyrau yn cefnogi'r cynigion. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cydnabod bod y sefyllfa hon yn un anarferol ac yn sylweddoli bod y gefnogaeth a fynegwyd yn dangos y dymuniad cryf ymhlith rhieni i weld y ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg yn ehangu, nod y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ei gefnogi'n llwyr.

## Casgliadau'r Prif Weinidog

Yn gryno, felly, byddai'r cynigion hyn, o'u gweithredu, yn arwain at gau Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne. Ar hyn o bryd, i bob pwrpas, mae dwy ysgol gynradd, Ysgol Treganna ac Ysgol Gynradd Radnor, yn rhannu safle. Byddai Ysgol Treganna yn symud i safle presennol Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne (a byddai newidiadau rhagnodedig yn cael eu gwneud er mwyn i hynny ddigwydd). Byddai disgyblion y byddai disgwyl iddynt, fel arall, fynychu Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne yn gallu trosglwyddo i Ysgol Gynradd Radnor, a byddai'r newidiadau rhagnodedig angenrheidiol yn cael eu gwneud er mwyn ehangu ei capasiti ac ehangu'r ystod oedran yn yr ysgol honno.

Ar ôl ystyried y mater yn ofalus, er ei fod o'r farn bod yr awdurdod lleol, yn ei ymatebion, wedi rhoi atebion digonol i'r rhan fwyaf o'r materion a godwyd yn y gwrthwynebiadau statudol, nid yw'r Prif Weinidog yn fodlon, yn achos rhai o'r materion, bod y cynigion yn unol â'r canllawiau yn y cylchlythyr. Mae ei gasgliadau penodol am y prif faterion perthnasol yn cael eu nodi isod. Roedd y Prif Weinidog hefyd o'r farn, er y byddai safon y ddarpariaeth yn gwella ar gyfer y sector cyfrwng Cymraeg, na fyddai'n gwella ar gyfer y sector cyfrwng Saesneg, yn enwedig yn y tymor byr (am gyfnod o hyd at 6 blynedd). Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi cael cyngor oddi wrth Estyn am yr agweddau addysgol a ganlyn ar y cynigion.

### (i) Safonau'r ddarpariaeth addysg yn yr ardal

Ar sail y dystiolaeth a geir yn adroddiadau mwyaf diweddar Estyn ac mewn data perfformiad sydd wedi'i feincnodi, ac ar sail cyngor gan Estyn, roedd y Prif Weinidog yn fodlon y byddai plant a fyddai'n trosglwyddo o Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne i Ysgol Gynradd Radnor yn cael safon dda o addysg o ran bod athrawon â chymwysterau priodol ar gael iddynt. Mae hyn yn cynnwys y ddarpariaeth a wneir ar gyfer plant ag Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig. Ar sail arolygiadau Estyn, ymddengys ar hyn o bryd fod ansawdd yr addysg yn y naill ysgol a'r llall yn debyg iawn. Byddai cyllideb fwy gan un ysgol fwy ar gyfer 420 o ddisgyblion, ac o'r herwydd, byddai ganddi fwy o hyblygrwydd o ran gwariant, a chan y byddai mwy o staff mewn ysgol o'r maint hwnnw, byddai mwy o gyfle i arbenigo mewn pynciau penodol ac i rannu arferion da, a byddai hynny hefyd yn hwyluso'r gwaith o ddarparu'r cwricwlwm.

O ran adeiladau ysgolion a'r cyfleusterau ynddynt, nid oedd y Prif Weinidog wedi'i argyhoeddi y byddai'r cynnig hwn yn arwain at wella'r ddarpariaeth am gyfnod o hyd at 6 blynedd ar ôl i'r cynigion gael eu rhoi ar waith ar gyfer disgyblion a fyddai'n mynychu Ysgol Heol Radnor yn y dyfodol. Nododd y Prif Weinidog, er bod cyfanswm capasiti'r adeiladau yn Ysgol Heol Radnor yn ddigon mawr i ddarparu ar gyfer 420 o ddisgyblion yn y tymor hwy, y byddai angen addasu'r adeiladau presennol er mwyn darparu ar gyfer nifer mwy o ddisgyblion na hynny (yn ôl yr wybodaeth a ddarparwyd gan yr awdurdod lleol, hyd at 575, o bosibl), oherwydd yn y tymor byr, byddai nifer mawr o'r disgyblion presennol yn Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne yn cael eu trosglwyddo i Ysgol Gynradd Radnor. Byddai hynny'n golygu y byddai'n rhaid cyfyngu ar y lle ategol a fyddai ar gael, a hynny er mwyn darparu ar gyfer y nifer mwy o ddisgyblion a fyddai ar y safle yn y tymor byrrach (ar sail yr wybodaeth a gafwyd oddi wrth yr Awdurdod lleol, gallai'r cyfnod hwnnw fod yn gyfnod o hyd at 6 blynedd).

Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn gwybod ei bod yn fwiad gan yr awdurdod lleol fuddsoddi yn yr adeiladau ac yn y maes chwarae er mwyn sicrhau bod darpariaeth briodol ar gael yn y tymor hwy; y bydd gwelliannau o ran mynediad i ddisgyblion anabl; a bod cynlluniau ar droed i wella'r lle chwarae allanol drwy ddarparu wynebaw mwy addas. Roedd yn destun pryder i'r Prif Weinidog bod y safle yn Ysgol Gynradd Radnor, at ei gilydd, o'i gymharu â'r canllawiau yn y Bwletin Adeiladu, 17% yn llai na'r maint a argymhellir ar gyfer ysgol â 420 o ddisgyblion oed cynradd, ynghyd â meithrinfa. Mae'r lle sydd ar gael y tu allan gryn dipyn yn llai hefyd nag y disgwyld ar gyfer ysgol newydd neu ysgol wedi'i hadnewyddu ar gyfer y nifer hwn o ddisgyblion. Felly, o ran cael manteisio ar ddarpariaeth briodol o ran lle y tu allan ac o ran lle chwarae, mae'r Prif Weinidog o'r farn na fyddai'r ddarpariaeth honno'n ddigonol yn Ysgol Heol Radnor ar ôl iddi gael ei hehangu, yn yr un modd ag y mae'r ddarpariaeth honno'n annigonol ar gyfer disgyblion sy'n mynychu'r 2 ysgol sydd ar y safle hwnnw ar hyn o bryd. Mae hwn yn fater y tynnwyd sylw ato mewn arolygiad gan Estyn o Ysgol Treganna.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cydnabod y ffaith nad yw'r canllawiau yn y Bwletin Adeiladu yn rhai statudol, ond mae'n pryderu y gallai'r trefniadau a gynigir ar gyfer Ysgol Heol Radnor gyfyngu ar yr ystod o brofiadau y byddai'r ysgol yn gallu eu cynnig ac ar y cyfleoedd i'r disgyblion ddysgu mewn amrywiaeth eang o ffyrdd. Ymhlith y cyfyngiadau posibl hynny y byddai diffyg lle ac adnoddau i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y gweithgareddau dysgu a gâi eu cynnig. Yn benodol, pe bai'r cynnig yn cael ei gymeradwyo, byddai sefyllfa'n codi yn y dyfodol agos lle na fyddai'r rheini a fyddai'n cael eu trosglwyddo o Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne yn gallu manteisio ar yr ystod o le chwarae a lle ategol ychwanegol sydd ar gael iddynt yn eu hysgol bresennol. Er bod y Prif Weinidog yn cydnabod y gallai'r cynigion wella safon y ddarpariaeth yn yr ardal o safbwynt yr elfen addysgu, roedd yn amau y byddai'n gwella'r ddarpariaeth o ran yr ystad ysgolion yn y sector cyfrwng Saesneg, a hynny am gyfnod o hyd at 6 blynedd neu am gyfnod a allai fod yn hwy na hynny.

Canfyddiad y Prif Weinidog oedd y byddai'r ddarpariaeth i ddisgyblion yn y sector cyfrwng Cymraeg yn gwella. Byddai ysgol fwy hyfyw yn cael ei chreu drwy gau Ysgol Tan yr Eos a thrwy drosglwyddo disgyblion i Ysgol Treganna, a fyddai wedi cael ei symud a'i hehangu, a lle y byddai darpariaeth feithrin ar gael. Gan y byddai mwy o staff yno, byddai hynny'n esgor ar fanteision cysylltiedig o ran darparu'r cwricwlwm. Byddai digon o le ar y safle newydd i alluogi disgyblion i fanteisio ar ystafell TG, a byddai yno hefyd fanteision eraill, nad ydynt ar gael iddynt ar hyn o bryd.

Daeth y Prif Weinidog i'r casgliad y byddai safon y ddarpariaeth addysgol, at ei gilydd, yn gwella ar gyfer y sector cyfrwng Cymraeg, ond nid oedd wedi'i argyhoeddi mai dyna fyddai'r sefyllfa yn y sector cyfrwng Saesneg, yn enwedig yn y tymor byr (am gyfnod o hyd at 6 blynedd), ond hefyd yn y tymor hwy, yn enwedig o'i chymharu â'r ddarpariaeth bresennol o ran y lle a'r adnoddau sydd ar gael.

## **(ii) Darparu cwricwlwm eang a chytbwys**

Mae yna agweddau ychwanegol ar y cynnig, sy'n gysylltiedig â'r safle a'r adeiladau yn Ysgol Gynradd Radnor, sydd wedi peri i'r Prif Weinidog gwestiynu a fydd y cynnig hwn, at ei gilydd, o fudd i addysg mwyafrif y plant sydd o dan sylw. Mae'r awdurdod lleol wedi dweud ei fod, wrth ddatblygu'r cynnig, wedi cyfeirio at y canllawiau yn y Bwletin Adeiladu, sy'n gwneud argymhellion am faint safleoedd. Ar ôl ceisio cyngor proffesiynol am faint safleoedd, ymddengys yn glir i'r Prif Weinidog fod y safle sydd ar gael yn Ysgol Gynradd Radnor yn llai na'r maint lleiaf a argymhellir yn y Bwletin Adeiladu ar gyfer 420 o ddisgyblion a meithrinfa ac ynddi 26 o leoedd (cyfwerth amser llawn). At hynny, mae'r awdurdod lleol wedi egluro wrth y Prif Weinidog, er mwyn rhoi'r cynnig ar waith, bod

posibilrwydd y byddai rhyw 575 o ddisgyblion, ar wahân i'r disgyblion meithrin, ar gofrestr Ysgol Gynradd Radnor yn y tymor byr (am gyfnod o oddeutu 6 blynedd).

Roedd yn destun pryder i'r Prif Weinidog y byddai cynifer o ddisgyblion ar safle sydd ychydig yn llai o faint na'r hyn a argymhellir ar gyfer ysgol ac ynddi 420 o ddisgyblion. Er ei bod yn bosibl y byddai lle yn yr adeiladau ar gyfer y nifer hwn o ddisgyblion, a hynny oherwydd y byddai modd bod yn fwy hyblyg wrth ddefnyddio ystafelloedd ac osgoi dyblygu defnydd, mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi nodi ei bod yn ymddangos y byddai'r neuadd a fyddai ar gael yn llai na'r maint a argymhellir ar gyfer ysgol ac ynddi 420 o ddisgyblion, heb sôn am 575, ac y byddai cryn dipyn yn llai o le y tu allan hefyd na'r isafswm a argymhellir ar gyfer 420 o ddisgyblion. Mae'r Prif Weinidog o'r farn ei fod yn bwysig bod gan ddisgyblion ddigon o le i chwarae a bod angen i'r lle sydd ar gael y tu allan fod yn addas hefyd ar gyfer cyfoethogi'r cwricwlwm, yn enwedig ar gyfer disgyblion yn y Cyfnod Sylfaen. Roedd hwn yn un o'r anawsterau y tynnodd rhai o'r gwrthwynebwyr sylw ato. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn pryderu y byddai'r cyfyngiadau o ran lle yn golygu na fyddai'r safle'n addas ar gyfer darparu cwricwlwm eang a chytbwys, yn arbennig felly ar gyfer y disgyblion iau.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn gwybod bod yr awdurdod lleol wedi awgrymu, er mwyn osgoi gorlenwi canfyddedig ar safle Ysgol Gynradd Radnor o ganlyniad i'r ffaith y byddai hyd at 600 o ddisgyblion yno, y gellid trosglwyddo disgyblion o Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne yn raddol ac y gellid cadw rhan o safle Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne at ddefnydd disgyblion cyfrwng Saesneg nes i'r nifer ar gofrestr Ysgol Gynradd Radnor ostwng i 420. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cydnabod bod nifer o ysgolion ar fwy nag un safle ac y gall trefniadau o'r fath weithio'n dda. Nid yw o'r farn bod trefniadau o'r fath yn ddelfrydol, ac mae'n credu y byddai'n well peidio â'u mabwysiadu er mwyn gweithredu cynnig, ac eithrio am gyfnod cyfyngedig iawn yn unig. Ym marn y Prif Weinidog, gallai awgrym yr awdurdod lleol arwain naill ai at greu ysgol ar fwy nag un safle am gyfnod o hyd at 6 blynedd, neu at sefyllfa dros yr un cyfnod o amser lle y byddai llawer mwy o ddisgyblion ar safle'r ysgol nag a ddylai fod. Nid yw'r Prif Weinidog o'r farn y byddai'r naill sefyllfa na'r llall yn fodd i sicrhau y byddai cwricwlwm eang a chytbwys yn cael ei ddarparu ar gyfer y plant hyn; mae hon yn ystyriaeth o'r pwys mwyaf y mae angen rhoi sylw iddi wrth benderfynu ar unrhyw gynnig (Cylchlythyr 23/02).

Er ei bod yn bosibl bod ysgolion eraill â thros 400 o ddisgyblion ar safleoedd tebyg o ran maint yn gweithredu'n foddhaol ar hyn o bryd mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru, ac yn wir yng Nghaerdydd ei hun, mae'r Prif Weinidog o'r farn, yn achos ysgolion sy'n rhan o gynnig ad-drefnu, mai'r nod yw sicrhau ysgol sy'n cynnig y cyfleoedd gorau posibl i ddisgyblion. Ar sail y canllawiau yn y Bwletin Adeiladu, dichon fod safle Ysgol Gynradd Radnor yn fwy addas ar gyfer ysgol ag 1.5 dosbarth mynediad nag ar gyfer ysgol â 2 ddosbarth mynediad, ac ar ôl ymgynghori â'r awdurdod lleol, bu'r Prif Weinidog yn pwysu a mesur a fyddai'n briodol addasu'r cynnig i'r perwyl hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, ni chafodd ei ddarbwylllo i ddilyn y trywydd hwn gan y byddai gwneud hynny'n golygu y byddai'r ddarpariaeth, o ran nifer y lleoedd cyfrwng Saesneg a fyddai ar gael, yn is na'r lefel y mae'r awdurdod lleol yn rhagweld y bydd ei hangen yn y dyfodol.

I grynhoi, felly, nid yw'r Prif Weinidog yn fodlon, o ran y mater hwn, y byddai'r cynigion yn fodd i sicrhau y byddai cwricwlwm eang a chytbwys yn cael ei ddarparu, a fyddai'n cynnwys holl elfennau gofynnol y cwricwlwm ar gyfer yr holl grwpiau oedran yr effeithid arnynt, gan gynnwys y rheini a fyddai'n mynd i'r ysgol ar safle Ysgol Gynradd Radnor yn y tymor byr ac yn y tymor hir.

### **(iii) Safon yr addysg a ddarperir ar hyn o bryd a gallu'r ysgolion i barhau i fedru cynnal safonau boddhaol**

O safbwynt y safonau a gyflawnir gan ddisgyblion, roedd y Prif Weinidog yn pryderu, pe bai'r cynnig yn cael ei weithredu, y gallai'r ffaith y byddai llai o le ategol ar gael yn Ysgol Gynradd Radnor yn y tymor byr olygu y byddai her yn wynebu'r athrawon o ran sicrhau bod safonau'n parhau i fod yn foddhaol.

Nododd y Prif Weinidog fod yr adroddiad arolygu diwethaf am Ysgol Treganna yn dda iawn a bod y safonau a gyflawnir gan y disgyblion yn dda. Mae'n anodd i'r Prif Weinidog ddod i gasgliad y naill ffordd neu'r llall ynghylch a fyddai peidio â gweithredu'r cynigion yn arwain at ddirywiad yn y safonau yn Ysgol Treganna, ond mae o'r farn y gallai safonau fod yn llai boddhaol yn y dyfodol os bydd yr awdurdod lleol yn parhau i beidio â chadw at y nifer derbyn sy'n cael ei bennu drwy ddefnyddio'r fformiwla ar gyfer penderfynu ar gapasiti. Pe bai Ysgol Treganna'n cael ei throsglwyddo i adeiladau mwy ac ynddynt offer gwell, gallai hynny fod yn fodd i wella cyrhaeddiad disgyblion. Er hynny, nid oedd y Prif Weinidog yn gallu dod i gasgliad pendant ynghylch a fyddai'r safonau a gâi eu cyflawni gan ddisgyblion a fyddai'n symud o ganlyniad i'r cynigion yn gwella neu'n dirywio o ganlyniad i'r cynigion hynny. Ni chafwyd unrhyw adroddiad am safon yr addysg yn Ysgol Tan yr Eos ac nid yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi gallu dod i unrhyw gasgliad ynghylch a fydd modd i'r ysgol gynnal safonau boddhaol ai peidio, naill ai o weithredu'r cynigion neu o beidio â'u gweithredu, er ei fod yn nodi mai dim ond digon o le ar gyfer y dyfodol agos iawn sydd ar gael yn yr ysgol.

Fodd bynnag, gan na chafwyd unrhyw gyngor gan Estyn i'r perwyl bod cysylltiad clir rhwng y safonau a gyflawnir gan ddisgyblion a'r lle a ddarperir ar eu cyfer, nid oedd y Prif Weinidog yn gallu gweld bod tystiolaeth gref y naill ffordd na'r llall i ddangos na fyddai'r ysgolion yn gallu cynnal safonau boddhaol o ran cyflawniad y disgyblion, naill ai o weithredu'r cynigion neu o beidio â'u gweithredu. O dan yr amgylchiadau hynny, nid oedd y Prif Weinidog o'r farn bod y mater hwn yn rheswm dros beidio â chymeradwyo'r cynigion.

### **Cyllid**

Roedd y Prif Weinidog o'r farn bod y cynigion yn ffordd gosteffeithiol o ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus drwy geisio defnyddio'r ffaith bod lleoedd gwag yn y sector cyfrwng Saesneg i fodloni'r angen am ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg. Nododd y byddai'r arbedion refeniw a fyddai'n dod yn sgil cau ysgolion yn helpu i fodloni'r costau cyfalaf sydd ynghlwm wrth wella adeiladau ysgolion a chroesawodd y dull hwnnw o weithredu.

### **Materion eraill a godwyd gan y gwrthwynebwyr**

Amrywiaeth ddiwylliannol/yr effaith ar ddisgyblion nad Saesneg yw eu mamiaith – ar sail Adroddiad Arolygiad Estyn ar Ysgol Gynradd Radnor a'r ffaith bod gan yr ysgol eisoes nifer mawr o blant o gefndiroedd lleiafrifoedd ethnig, nid yw'r Prif Weinidog yn ystyried bod unrhyw le i gredu y byddai plant o gefndiroedd o'r fath, gan gynnwys y rheini nad Saesneg yw eu mamiaith, o dan anfantais pe baent yn cael eu throsglwyddo o Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne i Ysgol Gynradd Radnor. Mae'r ddwy ysgol eisoes yn derbyn plant o gefndiroedd ethnig amrywiol, ac nid oes unrhyw dystiolaeth ym marn y Prif Weinidog i ddangos bod Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne yn gallu diwallu anghenion plant o gefndiroedd lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn well.

Roedd rhai gwrthwynebwyr yn pryderu y byddai gweithredu'r cynigion hyn yn arwain at anghydbwysedd yng nghyfansoddiad ethnig ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg ardal Treganna.

Gan fod lleiafrif sylweddol o ddisgyblion presennol Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne ac Ysgol Gynradd Radnor, ill dwy, yn dod o gefndiroedd lleiafrifoedd ethnig, os bydd y rhan fwyaf o blant Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne yn trosglwyddo i Ysgol Gynradd Radnor, fel y mae'r awdurdod lleol yn ei ddisgwyl, nid yw'n amlwg i'r Prif Weinidog y byddai'r sefyllfa yn newid rhyw lawer, pe bai'r cynnig hwn yn cael ei weithredu, o'r sefyllfa bresennol.

Gwasanaethu'r Gymuned – gan na fyddai unrhyw safle ysgol yn cael ei golli yn sgil gweithredu'r cynigion hyn, roedd y Prif Weinidog yn fodlon â dadl yr awdurdod lleol na fydd y cynigion hyn yn cael fawr o effaith ar y ddarpariaeth y tu allan i oriau ysgol, o ran y disgyblion nac o ran y gymuned ehangach.

Amcanestyniadau o niferoedd disgyblion/lleoedd dros ben/lleoedd mewn meithrinfeydd – mae'r Prif Weinidog yn nodi bod gwrthwynebwyr wedi nodi'n gywir bod y gyfradd genedigaethau yn ardal Treganna, yn ogystal â llawer o ardaloedd eraill yng Nghaerdydd, wedi cynyddu yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, a bod hyn yn cael effaith ar y niferoedd sy'n cael eu derbyn i addysg feithrin ac addysg gynradd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi gweld unrhyw dystiolaeth sy'n awgrymu nad yw methodoleg yr awdurdod lleol ar gyfer rhagamcanu niferoedd disgyblion yn y dyfodol yn briodol, nac unrhyw dystiolaeth ychwaith bod ei amcanestyniadau yn debygol o fod yn anghywir. Mae wedi edrych eto ar amcanestyniadau diweddaraf (2009) yr awdurdod lleol o niferoedd disgyblion a'u cymharu â'r niferoedd ar y gofrestr ym mis Ionawr 2010, ac mae'n fodlon y byddai gan yr ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg a fyddai ar ôl yn ardal Treganna, sy'n cynnig 420 lle yr un, ddigon o le rhyngddynt i fodloni'r galw am leoedd a fyddai'n codi yn ardal Treganna ei hun. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn nodi y byddai hynny, yn fwy na thebyg, yn golygu y byddai llai o ddisgyblion o'r tu allan i ardal Treganna wedi gallu cael lle mewn ysgolion yn Nhreganna nag sy'n cael lle ynddynt ar hyn o bryd, ond mae'n nodi bod hwn yn un o'r amcanion a gafodd eu datgan gan yr awdurdod lleol wrth gyflwyno'r cynnig, a'i fod yn gyson â'r egwyddor o 'ysgolion lleol i blant lleol'.

#### Safleoedd ysgolion/Atebion Amgen/Ymgynghori

Wrth wrthwynebu'r cynnig, mae rhai o'r gwrthwynebwyr o'r farn y byddai'n achosi cryn aflonyddwch i lawer o ddisgyblion ac athrawon, a bod nifer cymharol uchel o ddisgyblion lleol yn mynychu Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne.

Nododd y Prif Weinidog mai 31% yn unig o'r disgyblion yn nalgylch Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne sy'n mynychu eu hysgol cyfrwng Saesneg leol, ac mai 22% yn unig o ddisgyblion dalgylch Ysgol Gynradd Radnor sy'n mynychu eu hysgol cyfrwng Saesneg leol hwy. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi sylwi bod bron i ddwywaith nifer y disgyblion sy'n byw yn nalgylch Ysgol Gynradd Radnor yn byw yn nalgylch Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne, a bod dadl gref dros gefnogi cynnig i leoli ysgol gynradd cyfrwng Saesneg i wasanaethu'r ardal hon yn y dalgylch lle mae mwy o ddisgyblion yn dewis darpariaeth cyfrwng Saesneg ar hyn o bryd. Nododd y Prif Weinidog fod Ysgol Pwll Coch eisoes mewn lleoliad cyfleus i blant o ddalgylch Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne ac mai hon yw'r ysgol a ffeirir gan y rhan fwyaf o rieni'r dalgylch hwnnw sy'n dewis addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Er nad yw'n ymddangos, ym marn y Prif Weinidog, bod yr awdurdod lleol wedi datblygu'r cynnig mwyaf strategol posibl, mae'n cydnabod bod yr ysgolion sy'n rhan o'r cynnig hwn yn agos at ei gilydd o ran eu lleoliad, ac y byddai'r naill ysgol neu'r llall mewn lleoliad digon cyfleus i wasanaethu'r dalgylch cyfunol yn y dyfodol, ac na fyddai'n rhaid i ddisgyblion deithio pellteroedd afresymol i'r ysgol.

Mae llawer o wrthwynebwyr wedi awgrymu y byddai cynnig gwreiddiol yr awdurdod lleol (2006) i gau Ysgol Gynradd Radnor yn hytrach nag Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne, a

chaniatáu i Ysgol Treganna ymestyn i'r safle gwag, yn ffordd well o fynd i'r afael â'r mater o leoedd dros ben yn y sector cyfrwng Saesneg a'r gorallw yn y sector cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mae pryderon wedi'u mynegi hefyd nad oedd yr awdurdod lleol wedi ymgynghori yn benodol ar yr opsiwn i gau Ysgol Gynradd Radnor.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r Prif Weinidog yn nodi bod yr awdurdod lleol, mewn ymateb i'r gwrthwynebwyr, wedi cyflwyno sail resymegol dros ddewis yr opsiwn posibl o gau Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne a'i fod, o ganlyniad, wedi ymgynghori ar yr opsiwn hwnnw yn hytrach na'r un a ffeirir gan rai o'r gwrthwynebwyr.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cydnabod mai dim ond ar y cynigion y mae'n dymuno eu cyflwyno y mae gan yr awdurdod lleol yr hawl i ymgynghori arnynt ac mai rôl Gweinidogion Cymru yw penderfynu a ddylid cymeradwyo'r cynigion, eu cymeradwyo ag addasiadau, eu gwrthod, neu roi cymeradwyaeth amodol iddynt, ac nid o reidrwydd ystyried a allai cynnig gwahanol fod yn well. Fodd bynnag, er mai mater i'r awdurdod lleol yn unig yw penderfynu pa gynigion y mae'n dymuno ymgynghori arnynt, mae cyfraith achosion wedi cadarnhau bod gofyn ystyried yn gydwybodol y pwyntiau a'r materion sy'n codi yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad cyn dod i benderfyniad terfynol ac wrth benderfynu pa gynigion statudol i'w cyhoeddi. Cyflwynwyd y dadleuon dros gau Ysgol Gynradd Radnor ac ymestyn Ysgol Gynradd Treganna ar y safle hwnnw yn glir gan ymatebwyr i'r ymgynghoriad. Felly, roedd angen i'r awdurdod lleol ystyried y dadleuon hynny (a oedd yn ganlyniad i'r ymgynghoriad) mewn modd cydwybodol cyn dod i benderfyniad terfynol ynghylch y cynigion. Roedd yr awdurdod lleol yn sicr yn ymwybodol o'r dadleuon a gynigiwyd ac roedd ei adroddiad i'r Weithrediaeth cyn i'r cynigion gael eu cyhoeddi yn cynnwys nifer yr ymgynghoreion a oedd yn ffafrio cau Ysgol Gynradd Radnor yn hytrach nag Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n glir o'r wybodaeth a ddarparwyd gan yr awdurdod lleol i Weinidogion Cymru pa un a oedd wedi ystyried yn gydwybodol yr opsiwn o gau Ysgol Gynradd Radnor (a oedd yn ganlyniad i'r ymgynghoriad) cyn cyflwyno'r cynigion terfynol neu, gan fod yr awdurdod lleol eisoes wedi diystyru'r opsiwn hwnnw, nad oedd, mewn gwirionedd, wedi ystyried y dadleuon a wnaed mewn cysylltiad â'r mater hwn yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad. Pe byddai'r Prif Weinidog, fel arall, yn ystyried cymeradwyo'r cynigion, byddai wedi dymuno codi'r mater hwn gyda'r awdurdod lleol ac wedi ceisio sicrwydd bod yr awdurdod lleol, wrth ystyried ei benderfyniad, wedi ystyried y dadleuon o blaid cau Ysgol Gynradd Radnor a gyflwynwyd yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad. Fodd bynnag, gan nad yw'r Prif Weinidog o'r farn y dylid cymeradwyo'r cynigion am resymau eraill, nid oedd angen mynegi barn derfynol ar yr agwedd hon ar y gwrthwynebiadau i'r cynnig.

Mae nifer mawr wedi gwrthwynebu cau Ysgol Tan yr Eos, a rhai yn awgrymu y dylid ymestyn yr ysgol hon ar ei safle presennol neu ei hailsefydlu rywle arall, er mwyn iddi allu ddarparu ar gyfer y nifer cynyddol o blant o ardal Grangetown sy'n mynychu ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg yn ardal Treganna. Nododd y Prif Weinidog fod yr ysgol wedi'i sefydlu fel 'dosbarth dechreuol' i wasanaethu ardaloedd Treganna a Grangetown a'i bod, tra oedd y dasg o chwilio am safle parhaol yn mynd rhagddi, yn mynd i gael ei lleoli dros dro mewn adeiladau nad oeddynt yn cael eu defnyddio yn Ysgol Gynradd Parc Ninian. Mae'n nodi hefyd mai ychydig o'r plant sy'n mynychu Ysgol Tan yr Eos ar hyn o bryd sy'n dod o ardal Grangetown a bod Ysgol Tan yr Eos yn gweithredu ar hyn o bryd fel petai'n rhan o Ysgol Treganna. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'n nodi y bydd yr holl adeiladau sydd ar gael yn safle Parc Ninian yn llawn erbyn mis Medi 2010, gan adael ychydig iawn o amser i'r awdurdod lleol adeoli'r ysgol i safle arall. O ystyried y ffeithiau hyn, cred y Prif Weinidog ei bod hi'n rhesymol bod yr awdurdod lleol yn dymuno dod ag Ysgol Tan yr Eos ac Ysgol Treganna at ei gilydd fel un ysgol ar un safle. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn nodi bod lefel bresennol y ceisiadau am leoedd mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg oddi wrth rieni sy'n byw yn ardal

Grangetown yn awgrymu bod y galw yn ddigon uchel i'r awdurdod lleol ystyried sefydlu ysgol yno.

O ran yr ymgynghoriad, roedd y Prif Weinidog yn pryderu am y ffaith nad oedd sylw penodol wedi cael ei roi yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad i gau Ysgol Tan yr Eos, nac i'r dadleuon o blaid cymryd y cam hwnnw, ac mae'n ystyried y dylid fod wedi gwneud hynny. Yn y pen draw, fodd bynnag, mae'n fodlon bod yr ymgynghoriad, gan gynnwys cyfarfodydd â staff, llywodraethwyr a rhieni, wedi sicrhau bod y rheini a fyddai, o bosibl, yn dymuno gwrthwynebu cau Ysgol Tan yr Eos yn ymwybodol o'r opsiwn hwnnw ac am y sail resymegol drosto a'u bod wedi cael digon o gyfle i gynnig sylwadau arno. Er y gellid bod wedi cynnal yr ymgynghoriad ar Ysgol Tan yr Eos mewn ffordd well, mae'n fodlon bod yr ymgynghoriad wedi bod yn ddigonol ac ni fyddai wedi gwrthod y cynnig ar y sail honno.

Ar wahân i'r materion a nodwyd uchod, mae'r Prif Weinidog yn fodlon bod hyd yr ymgynghoriad (7 wythnos) a gynhaliwyd gan yr awdurdod lleol mewn cysylltiad â'r cynigion hyn, yn ogystal â'r modd y cynhaliwyd yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw, yn ddigonol a bod y rheini â buddiant yn y cynigion wedi cael cyfle i fynegi eu barn, gan gynnwys y rheini nad Cymraeg na Saesneg yw eu mamiaith.

### Trosglwyddo

Cydnabu'r Prif Weinidog y byddai'n rhaid mynd ati ar y cyd â staff a chyrrff llywodraethu'r ysgolion o dan sylw i bennu llawer o fanylion y trosglwyddo, pe bai'r cynnig yn cael ei gymeradwyo. Fodd bynnag, gallai'r awdurdod lleol fod wedi darparu manylion bras yr hyn y disgwylid iddo ddigwydd. Er hynny, mae'n fodlon nad oedd y diffyg hwn o ran gwybodaeth yn ddiffyg difrifol yn nilysrwydd y broses ymgynghori. Mae'r awdurdod lleol wedi rhoi gwybod i'r Prif Weinidog wedi hynny mai ei fwriad oedd y byddai pob plentyn yn trosglwyddo i'w lleoliadau newydd yn barod ar gyfer y flwyddyn academaidd newydd (2011-12).

Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi ystyried pob pwynt arall a godwyd yn y gwrthwynebiadau. Mae'r llythyr hwn yn nodi'r casgliadau y daethpwyd iddynt am y materion yr ymddengys i'r Prif Weinidog yw'r prif rai sy'n codi. Nid yw'r ffaith nad yw mater yn cael ei grybwyll yn benodol yn golygu na chafodd ei ystyried.

### **Casgliadau**

Wrth wrthod y cynnig hwn, mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cydnabod bod safle presennol Ysgol Gynradd Treganna/Ysgol Gynradd Radnor yn gweithredu gyda mwy na 420 o ddisgyblion.

Mae'r rhieni sy'n cynrychioli disgyblion yn yr ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg, sy'n cefnogi'r cynigion, wedi tynnu sylw at gyfyngiadau difrifol y safle ac mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cydymdeimlo'n llwyr â'u barn a'u dyhead cryf i gael adeiladau gwell ar gyfer eu plant. Fodd bynnag, o ran plant a fyddai'n trosglwyddo i Ysgol Gynradd Radnor o Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne, mae'n ymwybodol y gallai'r cyfyngiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â safle llai o faint amharu ar eu profiad addysgol. Codwyd y pwynt hwn gan y gwrthwynebwyr.

Er bod y Prif Weinidog wedi cael awgrymiadau oddi wrth yr awdurdod lleol ar sut y gellid mynd ati'n ymarferol i leddfu'r effaith hwn, nid yw wedi'i argyhoeddi bod yr awgrymiadau hynny yn ddigonol i wneud iawn am y ffaith na fyddai'r safle hwn yn bodloni'r gofynion sylfaenol o ran arwynebedd safle a argymhellir gan Fwletin Adeiladu 99. Mae'r Prif Weinidog o'r farn y gallai'r safle hwn gael effaith andwyol, yn benodol, ar ddarparu'r cyfnod sylfaen, a fydd yn dibynnu fwyfwy ar sicrhau bod disgyblion yn cael mynediad rheolaidd i fannau addas y tu allan.

I grynhoi, mae'r Prif Weinidog yn gwrthod y cynigion hyn am bob un o'r rhesymau a ganlyn:

- nid ydynt yn debygol o wella safon y ddarpariaeth addysg yn yr ardal. Yn benodol, gallent dynnu oddi ar y ddarpariaeth addysgol ar gyfer nifer sylweddol o ddisgyblion drwy ddarparu ysgol (yr ysgol Radnor newydd arfaethedig) na fydd ar safle digon o faint yn y tymor byr nac yn y tymor hir
- oherwydd y cyfyngiadau ffisegol, nid ydynt yn sicrhau y bydd cwricwlwm eang a chytbwys yn cael ei ddarparu ar gyfer nifer mawr o ddisgyblion am gyfnod o hyd at 6 mlynedd ac, o bosibl, am y dyfodol rhagweladwy

Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cydnabod bod yna ddadleuon cryf dros ad-drefnu ysgolion cynradd yn ardal Treganna yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'n gobeithio y bydd yr awdurdod lleol bellach yn ystyried o'r newydd sut y gall sicrhau bod y galw am leoedd ysgol yn ardal Treganna, yn y sector cyfrwng Cymraeg a'r sector cyfrwng Saesneg fel ei gilydd, a nifer y lleoedd sydd ar gael yn cydweddu'n well, gan sicrhau bod pob disgybl yn cael manteisio ar ysgolion lleol ag adeiladau a chyfleusterau priodol beth bynnag y bo'r cyfrwng iaith.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn hynod ymwybodol o gryfder y teimladau ymhlith rhieni disgyblion cyfrwng Cymraeg sy'n chwilio am ateb sy'n cynnig ysgol gynaliadwy ar gyfer y dyfodol yn eu cymdogaeth eu hunain. Mae'n siŵr, fodd bynnag, na fyddai'r rhieni hynny am weld effaith andwyol bosibl ar addysg grŵp llawer mwy o faint o ddisgyblion er mwyn bodloni eu hanghenion hwy. Er bod y Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol y bydd yr awdurdod lleol yn agor 3 ysgol newydd sy'n cynnig addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yng Nghaerdydd yn ystod y flwyddyn academaidd nesaf, mae'r cynnydd a wnaed hyd yma i fodloni'r galw yn yr ardal hon o Gaerdydd wedi bod yn araf. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn bod y cynnig wedi bod gerbron Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am fwy o amser nag y byddai'n dymuno. Fodd bynnag, mae natur gymhleth y cynigion hyn a'r nifer mawr o wrthwynebiadau a ddaeth i law wedi golygu bod ystyried y cynigion hyn wedi cymryd mwy o amser nag a fyddai'n arferol ar gyfer cynigion i ad-drefnu ysgolion. Mae'n nodi hefyd fod yr awdurdod lleol wedi ymgynghori ddwywaith ar y cynnig statudol hwn cyn cyhoeddi hysbysiad, a bod y 2 ymarfer hwn wedi cael eu cynnal 12 mis ar wahân. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cydnabod bod tasg anodd yn wynebu'r awdurdod lleol, ond mae'n ei annog i edrych ar y mater eto cyn gynted â phosibl.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog am weld yr awdurdod lleol yn mynd i'r afael â'r diffygion presennol o ran darpariaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn ardal Treganna **fel mater y dylid mynd i'r afael ag ef ar frys mawr** ac i gyflwyno cynigion a fydd yn sicrhau buddiannau pob disgybl yn y dyfodol.

Yr wyf yn anfon copi o'r llythyr hwn at Tom Morgan, Prif Weithredwr Cyngor Caerdydd, Penaethiaid a Chadeiryddion Llywodraethwyr Ysgol Gynradd Lansdowne, Ysgol Gynradd Radnor, Ysgol Treganna, Ysgol Tan yr Eos, Ysgol Gynradd Severn, Ysgol Gynradd Kitchener, ac Ysgol Gynradd Parc Ninian a'r gwrthwynebwyr statudol. Bydd y Prif Weithredwr, y Penaethiaid a Chadeiryddion y Llywodraethwyr yn derbyn copi o'r Datganiad Gwybodaeth.

Yn gywir

*Sylvia Lindoe.*

**SYLVIA LINDOE**

**PENNAETH YR IS-ADRAN RHEOLAETH AC EFFEITHIOLRWYDD YSGOLION**